



RESEARCH ARTICLE

**COMPATIBILITY OF *TRICHODERMA* SPP. WITH SOME FUNGICIDES UNDER *IN VITRO* CONDITIONS**

**Wafa Khirallah<sup>1</sup>, Najoua Mouden<sup>1</sup>, Karima Selmaoui<sup>1</sup>, El Hassan Achbani<sup>2</sup>, Rachid Benkirane<sup>1</sup>, Amina Ouazzani Touhami<sup>1</sup> and Allal Douira<sup>1\*</sup>**

<sup>1</sup>Laboratoire de Botanique, Biotechnologie et Protection des Plantes, Département des Sciences de la vie, Faculté des Sciences, Université Ibn Tofail, Kénitra, Maroc

<sup>2</sup>Unité de Recherche en Protection des Plantes, Laboratoire de Bactériologie Végétale et de Lutte Biologique, CRRA de Meknès, Meknès, Maroc

**ARTICLE INFO**

**Article History:**

Received 16<sup>th</sup> November, 2015

Received in revised form 24<sup>th</sup> November, 2015

Accepted 23<sup>rd</sup> January, 2016

Published online 28<sup>th</sup> February, 2016

**Key words:**

*Trichoderma harzianum*,  
*T. viride*, fungicides,  
compatibility.

**ABSTRACT**

The compatibility between strains of *Trichoderma harzianum* (Tcomp, TH1 and TH3) and *T. viride* (TV1) and different active ingredients used as fungicides against seeds borne and foliar diseases of some cultures were tested under *in vitro* conditions. The activities of the formulations, pyraclostrobin + boscalid, cyprodinil + fludioxonil, fenhexamid and mepanipyrim were null to low on the mycelial growth of the strains tested. The compatibility percentages were low to moderate the first week, respectively 35.9, 10.0, 28.7 and 34.4% for TH3 and 59.1, 32.8, 61.9 and 84.1% for Tcomp at the recommended doses 501, 375, 750 and 400 ppm. They become high during the second week respectively 88.1, 75.4 and 100%.

Seven days after incubation, the compatibility of Tcomp and TH3 was moderate (51.4%) at 200 ppm of pyrimethanil and become important after 16 days, respectively 65.0 and 78.7%. 32 days after incubation, this fungicide showed a moderate activity at the recommended dose (800 ppm), the compatibility percentages varied between 33.3 and 68.5%.

After the second week, the chlorothalonil at 500 ppm showed good compatibility with Tcomp and TV1 (51.9 and 48.2%) and all the strains tested except TH1 become moderately compatible (43.5 – 72.2%) with the different concentrations after 24 days of incubation. However, thiram was able to completely inhibit mycelial growth of the *Trichoderma* stains during 4 weeks. No compatibility was observed between them.

After one month, the *Trichoderma* strains produced conidia in the presence of low concentrations of chlorothalonil and in the recommended dose of fenhexamid, showing compatibility respectively ranging from 50.5 to 89.7% and 51.5 to 97.1%. The conidia production of the tested strains was inhibited at the recommended doses of the other fungicides tested. However, thiram showed good compatibility at 500 and 666.6 ppm ranging from 45.5 to 84.9%. Similarly, boscalid + Pyraclostrobin at 125.5 ppm and cyprodinil + fludioxonil at 93.7 ppm were compatible respectively with TH3 and TV1 (50.6-56.1%) and TH1-TH3 (90.4-79.3%).

After 24 hours of incubation, the *Trichoderma* conidia could germinate in the presence of different concentrations of mepanipyrim and fenhexamid showing compatibility respectively ranging from 45.0 to 98.0% and 37.5 to 97.1%. The Tcomp strain showed good ability to germinate in presence of low doses of thiram (500 ppm), chlorothalonil (375 ppm), boscalid + pyraclostrobin (125.2 ppm) and cyprodinil + fludioxonil (93.7) with respective compatibility percentages of 54.3, 54.2, 75.5 and 57.2%.

© Copy Right, IJRSR, 2016, Academic Journals. All rights reserved.

**INTRODUCTION**

Biological control involves the use of beneficial microorganisms to attack and control plant pathogens, and the diseases they cause. It is an environmentally acceptable approach to disease management. Among the fungal biocontrol agents *Trichoderma* spp. have acquired much importance (Papavizas, 1985; Sreenivasaprasad et Manibhushanrao, 1990).

*Trichoderma* spp. are fungi that occur worldwide. Recent studies show that they are not only parasites of fungal plant pathogens but also can produce antibiotics. In addition, certain strains can induce systemic and localized resistance to several plant pathogens. Moreover, some strains may enhance plant growth and development (Ha, 2010).

*Trichoderma* spp. has received the most attention for control soil borne pathogens. *Trichoderma harzianum* is a fungal

\*Corresponding author: Allal Douira

Laboratoire de Botanique, Biotechnologie et Protection des Plantes, Département des Sciences de la vie, Faculté des Sciences, Université Ibn Tofail, Kénitra, Maroc

biocontrol agent that attacks a range of pathogenic fungi. It can be used either alone or in combination with other *Trichoderma* species in biological control of several plant diseases (Papavizas, 1985; Chet, 1987; Samuels, 1996).

Although not normally associated with foliar surfaces, *Trichoderma* spp. have been widely investigated also for the control of foliar diseases, particularly gray mould caused by *Botrytis cinerea* on Lettuce (Card, 2005), snapbeans (Nelson and Powelson, 1988), strawberry, blackberry and grape (Archbold *et al.*, 1997), cucumber (Lee *et al.*, 2006), tomato (Hmouni *et al.*, 2006; Lisboa *et al.*, 2007), *Eucalyptus globulus* (Zaldúa and Sanfuentes, 2010) and Faba bean (Bendahmane *et al.*, 2012).

*Trichoderma* has been successful applied to aerial plant parts for the biocontrol of decay fungi in wounds on shrubs and trees (Papavizas, 1985), brown blotch caused by *Colletotrichum truncatum* on cowpea (Bankole and Adebajo, 1996), anthracnose induced on strawberry by *Colletotrichum acutatum* (Freeman *et al.*, 2004), *Helminthosporium oryzae* causal agent of Brown spot of rice (Mouria *et al.*, 2003), four species of *Bipolaris* (*B. maydis*, *B. sorokiniana*, *B. sorghicola* and *B. tetramera*) on Sorghum (Berber *et al.*, 2009). Actually, among the aspects that future research should focus on to make better use of *Trichoderma* as a biocontrol agent for the management of crop diseases, the first is the ability of *Trichoderma* for control of foliar pathogens / air (Ramanujam *et al.*, 2010).

Although use of biocontrol agents could reduce chemical application to a limited extent, it is less reliable and less efficient (Monte, 2001). One of the most promising possibilities for the application of biocontrol *Trichoderma* strains is within the frames of a complex integrated plant protection, which is based on the combined application of physical, chemical and biological means of control. In the case of the application of a complex integrated strategy when *Trichoderma* strains are combined with chemical pesticides, therefore it is important to collect information about the effects of pesticides on the biocontrol agent (Kredics *et al.*, 2003).

The combined use of biocontrol agents and chemical pesticides has attracted much attention as a way to obtain synergistic or additive effects in the control of soil-borne pathogens (Locke *et al.*, 1985). The effect of certain fungicides and herbicides on *Trichoderma* spp. was reported earlier with an emphasis on practical applications (Kredics *et al.*, 2003).

The objective of the present study was to check the compatibility of some strains of *Trichoderma* spp. with different fungicides actually used against seed borne diseases (sugar beet, wheat, corn and pulses) and foliar diseases (peach leaf curl, *Monilia* brown rot and scab leaves of pear, peach, apple, almond; grey mould and/or anthracnose of strawberry, tomato, melon, grape vine, lettuce, green beans).

## MATERIALS AND METHODS

### *Trichoderma* spp. strains

Three strains of *Trichoderma harzianum* (Tcomp, TH1 and TH3) and a strain of *Trichoderma viride* (TV1) belonging to

the culture collection of the Laboratory of Botany, Biotechnology and Plant Protection (Morocco) grown on PSA medium (potato 200 g, Sucrose 20 g, Agar-agar: 15 g, distilled water 1000 ml) and incubated at  $28 \pm 1^\circ\text{C}$  in the dark.

### Tested fungicides

Seven fungicides were tested viz. BASULTRA (Thiram 80% WP), CLORTOSIP (Chlorothalonil 75% WP), FRUPICA 50 WP (Mepanipyrim 50% WP), PYRUS 400 SC (Pyrimethanil 400 g/L), SIGNUM WG (Boscalid 26.7% + Pyraclostrobin 6.7% WG), SWITCH 62.5 WG (Cyprodinil 37.5% + Fludioxonil 25% WG), TELDOR 50 WG (Fenhexamid 50% WG) (ONSSA, 2015).

### Compatibility estimation of *Trichoderma* spp. with fungicides

Stock solutions of agrochemicals were prepared by dissolving the required quantities of each into sterile distilled water. Increasing concentrations ( $\frac{1}{4}$  (R.D.), (R.D.),  $\frac{1}{2}$  (R.D.),  $\frac{3}{4}$  (R.D.) and Recommended dose) were then prepared and incorporated into the PSA culture medium kept molten at  $50^\circ\text{C}$  and were mixed thoroughly by gentle shaking. The mixture was then poured into Petri plates. PSA plates without any added compounds served as controls.

After solidification, the plates were inoculated with 5-mm discs of 7 days-old *Trichoderma* spp. strains cultures. Three replicates were used for each concentration of every tested fungicide. The inoculated plates were incubated at  $28 \pm 1^\circ\text{C}$  in the darkness and radial colony diameter was recorded every eight days after inoculation for one month. To determine the number of the conidia produced, four 5-mm discs were taken from one month old cultures on PSA for each treatment, put in a test tube containing 1 ml of sterile distilled water and shaken for 5 min using an orbital shaker at 30 rpm. The conidia concentration was measured using a Malassez slide. Each experiment was replicated ten times. To determine the percentage germination of conidia, 0.2 mL of a conidial suspension ( $10^3$  conidia / mL) obtained using 7 days old cultures grown on PSA was spread on the surface of Petri plates containing Water agar Medium (Agar-agar: 15 g, Distilled water 1000 ml) supplemented with different concentrations of the tested fungicides. The plates were then incubated for 24 h at  $28^\circ\text{C}$  in the dark. At the end of the incubation period, the frequency of germinated conidia (germ tube length greater than the length of the conidia) in a sample of 200 conidia per plate was determined by microscopic examination. Three replicates were used for each concentration of every tested fungicide. The mean percentages of inhibition of mycelial radial growth, conidia production and conidia germination relative to controls, were calculated for each fungicide using the following formula (Vincent, 1947) and converted into percent compatibility (100- Percent Inhibition):

$$\text{Percent Inhibition} = ((X - Y)/X) \times 100$$

Where

X = control

Y = treatment

Data were analyzed by one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) and LSD test at 5% level.

**Table 1** Observations of the compatibility (%) of four *Trichoderma* spp. with the fungicides Balustra, Chlortosip and Frupica estimated on the mycelial radial growth.

Trichoderma strains	Time (days)	Thiram concentrations (ppm)					Chlorothalonil concentrations (ppm)					Mepanipyrim concentrations (ppm)				
		500	666,6	1000	1500	2000	375	500	750	1125	1500	100	133,3	200	300	400
Tcomp	8	11.1c	0c	0	0	0	35.2c	34.3c	28.7d	16.7d	18.1d	59.3b	46.3b	44.5b	41.5b	34.1b
	16	34.8b	16.7b	10.0	10.6	0	49.3b	51.9b	42.6c	40.8c	40.8c	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a
	24	70.4a	44.1a	22.2	15.6	0	62.1ab	55.6b	54.6b	55.6b	50.9b	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a
	32	74.9a	52.8a	34.3	20.4	0	79.6a	74.1a	68.5a	64.8a	62.1a	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a
TH1	8	06.7d	0b	0	0	0	12.9	09.3	0b	0b	0b	36.1b	28.7c	26.8c	26.8c	14.8c
	16	22.2c	0b	0	0	0	24.1	18.5	16.1a	16.7a	14.8a	100a	83.3b	68.5b	51.5b	30.4b
	24	40.0b	11.5a	0	0	0	24.1	18.5	16.1a	16.7a	14.8a	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a
	32	50.0a	21.3a	07.4	0	0	24.1	18.5	16.1a	16.7a	14.8a	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a
TH3	8	0c	0c	0	0	0	29.6b	29.1b	19.6c	19.5c	17.8c	51.9b	41.7b	37.1b	37.1b	34.4b
	16	28.2b	12.2b	2.6	0	0	40.8b	37.9b	33.3b	31.5b	27.8b	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a
	24	43.7ab	21.3a	12.4	11.9	0	61.1a	57.4a	55.6a	53.7a	43.5a	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a
	32	57.4a	28.9a	15.9	12.8	0	61.1a	57.4a	55.6a	53.7a	43.5a	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a
TV1	8	11.1c	0d	0	0b	0	35.5c	34.7c	34.7c	20.4c	20.7c	52.8b	46.3b	44.5b	37.9b	32.4b
	16	35.9b	27.8c	10.0	10.4b	0	49.1b	48.2b	44.5b	38.9b	38.9b	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a
	24	72.8a	50.0b	32.2	31.7ab	0	57.4b	53.7b	53.7b	53.7a	50.0ab	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a
	32	74.1a	61.1a	44.4	45.2a	0	72.2a	68.5a	68.5a	64.8a	59.3a	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a

Two results of the same concentration and the same strain affected by the same letter show no significant difference at 5%

**Table 2** Observations of the compatibility (%) of four *Trichoderma* spp. with the fungicides Pyrus, Sigum, Switch and Teldor estimated on the mycelial radial growth.

Trichoderma strains	Time (days)	Pyrimethanil concentrations (ppm)					Pyraclostrobin concentrations (ppm) + Boscalid					Cyprodinil + Fludioxonil concentrations (ppm)					Fenhexamid concentrations (ppm)				
		200	222,6	400	600	800	125,2	167	250,5	375,7	501	93,7	125	187,5	281,2	375	187,5	250	375	562,5	750
Tcomp	8	54.1b	42.4b	26.5b	16.3b	11.1c	63.9b	63.5b	63.0b	59.2b	59.1b	45.9b	45.6b	40.8b	32.8b	100	100	66.7	62.9b	61.9b	
	16	85.0a	69.4a	46.5a	26.1b	25.9bc	100a	97.2a	96.3a	91.6a	88.9a	89.6a	88.9b	86.9a	70.1a	75.4a	100	100	100a	100a	
	24	87.0a	70.8a	52.6a	35.4ab	33.3b	100a	100a	100a	100a	99.0a	100a	96.3a	96.3a	96.3a	100	100	100	100a	100a	
	32	97.0a	72.2a	60.2a	55.6a	52.4a	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a	100	100	100	100a	100a	
TH1	8	30.8c	29.1c	30.5b	19.4c	19.3b	36.3c	35.9d	34.3c	34.6c	34.6c	19.9c	16.3c	15.4c	14.4c	12.4c	51.9b	45.6b	53.7b	42.6b	
	16	49.5b	51.9b	46.9b	40.8b	34.3ab	82.6b	68.5c	67.0b	67.0b	51.8bc	68.3b	68.7b	69.8b	59.3b	55.6b	100a	100a	100a	100a	
	24	79.1a	71.9a	70.5a	67.8a	38.9a	100a	87.1b	77.7b	74.0b	73.1ab	100a	96.3a	96.3a	88.9a	75.1a	100a	100a	100a	100a	
	32	79.6a	77.8a	74.3a	70.8a	44.8a	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a	89.8a	100a	100a	100a	100a	
TH3	8	54.1c	42.2b	22.2c	12.8b	0c	39.3c	39.2c	38.9c	39.1b	35.9b	30.0b	20.0b	16.6a	09.3b	10.0b	64.8b	26.9b	27.8b	28.7b	
	16	78.7b	75.0a	42.0b	32.6b	24.3b	54.6bc	52.4b	52.2b	50.4ab	46.5ab	91.7a	82.5a	74.5a	75.4a	54.6ab	100a	100a	100a	100a	
	24	79.1a	80.9a	72.0a	64.3a	60.2a	67.6ab	63.9a	62.0a	59.8a	53.7a	94.5a	88.9a	88.9a	88.9a	88.9a	100a	100a	100a	100a	
	32	79.6a	80.9a	75.7a	70.9a	68.5a	70.3a	70.3a	67.6a	62.6a	55.0a	100a	94.4a	100a	91.1b	89.7a	100a	100a	100a	100a	
TV1	8	38.9c	37.9	17.0c	17.0c	16.3	68.2b	50.1b	49.3b	49.3c	47.9c	16.7c	14.8c	13.9b	12.4b	11.9c	100	40.8b	40.8b	40.8b	
	16	50.0bc	50.4	28.9b	24.6b	23.7	100a	100a	90.8a	89.8b	88.9b	50.6b	46.9b	36.3b	30.4b	23.9c	100	100a	100a	100a	
	24	60.0ab	58.9	35.4a	34.3a	28.2	100a	100a	100a	96.3ab	92.6b	100a	96.3a	86.7a	85.2a	65.9b	100	100a	100a	100a	
	32	65.7a	62.6	41.3a	37.1a	33.3	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a	100a	92.6a	92.6a	92.6a	100	100a	100a	100a	

Two results of the same concentration and the same strain affected by the same letter show no significant difference at 5%

**Table 3** Observations of the compatibility (%) of four *Trichoderma* spp. with the fungicides Balustra, Chlortosip and Frupica estimated on the conidia production (Cp) and germination (G).

Trichoderma strains	parameters	Thiram concentrations (ppm)					Chlorothalonil concentrations (ppm)					Mepanipyrim concentrations (ppm)				
		500	666,6	1000	1500	2000	375	500	750	1125	1500	100	133,3	200	300	400
Tcomp	Cp	55.6a	45.5b	20.7c	18.8c	0d	71.7a	52.2b	50.5b	40.6b	39.8b	1.6a	1.1ab	0.9bc	0.6bc	0.4c
	G	54.3a	48.7a	43.0ab	40.8ab	31.3c	54.2a	46.2b	40.2bc	38.3c	36.2c	92.0a	90.8a	86.8ab	81.0b	48.5c
TH1	Cp	69.5a	53.9b	47.6b	38.0c	0d	63.2	63.9	62.6	62.0	61.5	2.9a	2.8a	2.4ab	1.4b	0c
	G	40.2a	40.0a	35.8ab	32.2bc	28.7c	18.5a	16.8ab	15.2bc	13.3bc	11.8c	55.5a	50.8ab	48.7ab	47.7ab	45.0b
TH3	Cp	84.8a	84.9a	52.7b	49.2b	0c	85.6a	74.6b	69.3bc	65.5c	56.5d	6.7a	5.9a	5.0ab	3.9b	0a
	G	37.3a	37.7a	37.6a	32.8ab	26.8b	20.3ab	20.2ab	21.2a	18.0bc	17.7c	65.3a	58.5b	49.8c	47.7c	45.7c
TV1	Cp	71.9a	61.4a	35.2b	24.9b	0c	89.7a	84.4a	50.9b	37.7c	28.3c	7.0	3.5	6.4	1.7	0
	G	43.8a	42.0ab	38.2ab	34.2ab	32.3b	25.2	23.5	23.2	21.7	21.7	58.7a	53.3b	51.7b	50.0ab	46.8b

Two results of the same fungicide in the same line affected by the same letter show no significant difference at 5%

**Table 4** Observations of the compatibility (%) of four *Trichoderma* spp. with the fungicides Pyrus, Signum, Switch and Teldor estimated on the conidia production (Cp) and germination (G).

Trichoderma strains	parameters	Pyrimethanil concentrations (ppm)					Boscalid + Pyraclodtrbine concentrations (ppm)					Cyprodinil + Fludioxonil concentrations (ppm)					Fenhexamid concentrations (ppm)				
		200	222,6	400	600	800	125,2	167	250,5	375,7	501	93,7	125	187,5	281,2	375	187,5	250	375	562,5	750
Tcomp	Cp	1.2a	0.9ab	0.4bc	0.4bc	0.3c	21.8a	14.6ab	12.9b	12.3b	12.2b	34.9a	18.1b	12.8bc	10.7cd	5.1d	63.6a	55.9b	44.5c	38.7c	22.5d
	G	10.0	3.5	18.8	1.2	0	75.5a	72.8a	61.3ab	57.2ab	49.0b	57.2a	38.0ab	19.8b	19.0b	16.0b	95.2a	93.3a	82.8ab	84.2ab	60.7b
TH1	Cp	3.1a	1.8ab	1.5bc	1.4bc	1.0c	15.3a	7.7ab	3.4b	2.5b	2.1b	96.4a	78.0a	65.6ab	53.6bc	32.9c	82.8a	79.5ab	71.9ab	63.9bc	51.5c
	G	0	0	0	0	0	30.3a	24.7a	8.0b	6.8b	6.3b	22.5a	13.7a	1.7b	0.5b	0b	51.3	52.5	51.2	50.3	45.2
TH3	Cp	19.8a	4.6b	1.7b	1.4b	0.8b	50.6a	28.5ab	23.1b	9.9c	8.6c	79.3a	33.2b	29.6b	24.9b	18.1b	78.7	73.3	55.1	66.0	60.8
	G	0.8	0.17	0	0	0	66.5a	55.7a	38.5b	33.2b	10.2c	40.5a	21.2a	18.3b	0.8c	0c	46.8a	43.5a	44.0a	38.0b	37.5b
TV1	Cp	6.3a	2.2ab	1.7b	0.8b	0.8b	56.1a	46.8ab	37.1bc	25.9c	20.2c	7.5a	4.8ab	3.0ab	2.6ab	1.2b	97.1a	89.8a	57.5b	58.7b	56.9b
	G	5.5	2.0	21.6	0.7	0	67.2a	64.5a	63.8a	60.5a	46.0b	30.3a	30.3a	4.7b	4.5b	4.3b	45.4	44.0	42.3	43.3	39.2

Two results of the same fungicide in the same line affected by the same letter show no significant difference at 5%

## RESULTS

The compatibility of some active ingredients was tested *in vitro* on mycelia radial growth, conidia production and germination of three strains of *Trichoderma harzianum* and one strain of *T. viride*.

After one week, the mycelial growth of *Trichoderma* spp. strains was totally inhibited on PSA media amended with the concentrations tested of thiram, the compatibility was null. This absence of compatibility persists after 4 weeks of incubation at the recommended dose (2000 ppm). At the lowest dose, the strain of *T. harzianum* (Tcomp) and *T. viride* (TV1) showed a good compatibility equal to 70.4 and 72.8% three weeks after incubation. In the presence of chlorothalonil, mycelial growth of Tcomp, TH3 and TV1 was low after the first week of incubation. The compatibility was moderate to high in the third week. TH1 strain showed a low compatibility during the four weeks. The four strains compatibility was low to moderate with all the mepanipyrim concentrations in the first week and high (100%) in the second week (Table 1).

*Trichoderma harzianum* strains (Tcomp and TH3) showed compatibility of 54% at 200 ppm of pyrimethanil after 8 days and reached 97 and 79% respectively after 32 days of incubation. This compatibility was low to medium at 800 ppm. In the presence of the recommended doses of boscalid + pyraclostrobin; cyprodinil + fludioxonil and fenhexamid, Tcomp showed a moderate compatibility in the first week. This compatibility has become very important for all strains in the second week (Table 2).

After one month of incubation, thiram and mepanipyrim prevented conidia production by different strains of *Trichoderma* spp. at the different tested concentrations except at 500 and 666.6 ppm of thiram concentrations, which allowed a compatibility ranging from 55.6 to 84.9%. In the presence of chlorothalonil, compatibility was low to medium at 1500 ppm and increases gradually as the fungicide concentration decreases (Table 3).

No compatibility was observed between the conidia production of *Trichoderma* spp. strains and pyrimethanil, boscalid + pyraclostrobin and cyprodinil + fludioxonil. However, the strains TH3 and TV1 exhibited moderate compatibility in the presence of 125.2 ppm of boscalid + pyraclostrobin. Indeed, TH1 and TH3 strains showed a significant compatibility in the presence of 93.7 ppm of Cyprodinil + fludioxonil. Only TH3 strain showed moderate compatibility with the other concentrations of cyprodinil + fludioxonil. The Fenhexamid was compatible with the conidia production of the four strains of *Trichoderma* spp. It has been moderate for Tcomp and important for the other strains (Table 4).

A moderate to low compatibility was detected between the conidia germination of the *Trichoderma* spp. strains and thiram after increasing its concentrations. This compatibility was moderate at 375 ppm of Chlorothalonil only with Tcomp (54.2%). The mepanipyrim was highly (92 to 81%) to moderately (48.5%) compatible with the conidia germination of Tcomp as increasing concentrations and moderate with the other strains (Table 3).

The pyrimethanil was not compatible with the conidia germination of the four tested strains. The boscalid + pyraclostrobin showed a great to a medium compatibility with Tcomp strain in parallel to the increase of the fungicide concentrations. Low compatibility was remarked between the association cyprodinil + fludioxonil and conidia germination of tested *Trichoderma* spp. strains except Tcomp which showed a compatibility of 57.2% with 93.7 ppm of the fungicide. This same strain of *T. harzianum* showed high compatibility with fenhexamid varied from 95.2 to 60.7% at progressively increasing concentrations. However, this compatibility is moderate for the other strains (Table 4).

## DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

Fungicides tested *in vitro* showed variable activity on the three life cycle stages of the *Trichoderma harzianum* and *T. viride* strains.

The compatibility estimated on the mycelial radial growth was moderate between the combination pyraclostrobin + boscalid and *Trichoderma* spp. in the first week and become very important from a second week. This compatibility was moderate with conidia germination and low with the conidia production. Pyraclostrobin and boscalid belong respectively to the strobilurins and carboxamides chemical groups. The fungitoxic activity of strobilurins is exercised at the reduction site ubihydroquinone Qo, by blocking electron transfer between cytochrome b and c1 of the mitochondrial respiratory chain, by inhibiting the production of ATP (Becker *et al.*, 1981; Von Jagow et Link, 1986) and therefore the fungus growth (Zheng *et al.* 2000; Bartlett *et al.*, 2002; Bahous *et al.*, 2005). carboxamides are inhibitors of complex II (Leroux, 2003).

Divya *et al.* (2011) showed that the wild strain of *T. harzianum* was insensitive to the half of the pyraclostrobin recommended dose. Conidia germination of *T. atroviride* was highly sensitive to Signum but *T. asperellum* was not sensitive to low concentrations of this fungicide (Shovan, 2012). The synergism mechanism of *T. harzianum* combined with boscalid to *Botrytis cinerea* determined by microscopy method, mycelium growth rate and disc filter method was showed by the mycelium partial dissolution of *B. cinerea*, the beneficial to *T. harzianum* to occupy nutrition and space and enhanced the antifungal activity of volatile compounds of *T. harzianum* to *B. cinerea* (Fangsheng *et al.*, 2013).

The combination cyprodinil + fludioxonil had moderate effect on mycelial growth of *Trichoderma* strains tested but showed good compatibility from the second week. However, only the TH1 strain gives a moderate compatibility on the conidia production whose germination was completely inhibited. The dual action of cyprodinil and fludioxonil is due to its containing active ingredients of two different families, anilinopyrimidine (cyprodinil) (Heye *et al.*, 1994; Hilber and Hilber-Bodmer 1998) and phenylpyrrole (fludioxonil) (Gehmann *et al.*, 1990; Nyfeler and Ackermann, 1992). The first inhibits the biological synthesis of methionine, one of the principal components of the fungus protein synthesis (Masner, 1994; Leroux 1996), while fludioxonil stimulates intracellular glycerol accumulation, which blocks the cell growth in the fungus (Leroux 1996; Pillonel and Meyer, 1997). *Botrytis*

control by a mixture of cyprodinil with fludioxonil remained excellent (Forster and Staub, 1996) and the three fungicides, fludioxonil, cyprodinil, and a mixture of fludioxonil and cyprodinil, were equally effective against thiabendazole-sensitive and -resistant isolates of *P. expansum* (Errampalli and Crnko, 2004). The conidia germination of *T. atroviride* and *T. asperellum* were moderately sensitive to Switch (Shovan, 2012).

The pyrimethanil inhibited moderately mycelial growth and strongly production of conidia and germination of all strains of *Trichoderma* spp. tested. Yuan *et al.* (2007) reported that the strain of *Trichoderma* T-21 has shown pyrimethanil resistance and that the growth and the conidia production of the strain were good. Two mutants tolerant to pyrimethanil were obtained by UV-light induction on PDA amended with pyrimethanil from a wild *Trichoderma* strain. Tolerance level was observed 20 times in comparison with that of mother strain. The mutants could maintain their tolerance after 8 times of transfers on the fungicide free PDA. Two tolerant strains kept the ability of antagonism against *Botrytis cinerea* *in vitro* and *in vivo* (Hongman *et al.*, 2005). The study conducted by Gabriolotto *et al.* (2009) on effectiveness of control strategies against *Botrytis cinerea* in vineyard and evaluation of the residual fungicide concentrations showed that the application of three treatments of a *Trichoderma* spp. was really ineffective against grey mold, even though in association with pyrimethanil.

Pyrimethanil, whose mode of action is not fully understood, interfere at the amino acid level and mainly at the methionine biosynthesis (Heye *et al.*, 1994). Polygalacturonase, cellulase, proteinase and laccase activities were all decreased in the medium of three day-old cultures grown of *Botrytis cinerea* in the presence of pyrimethanil. No significant growth inhibition was observed at the pyrimethanil concentrations tested. Pyrimethanil did not inhibit the enzymes directly, nor did it inhibit the synthesis of cytosolic proteins. Therefore, it was proposed that the fungicide inhibits protein secretion at a post-translational stage in the secretory pathway. It appears that pyrimethanil is most active in media where the fungus has to utilize extracellular enzymes to mobilize the nutrients it requires for growth (Milling and Richardson, 1995). Biochemical studies indicate that the anilinopyrimidines inhibit the biosynthesis of methionin by blocking cystathionine-lyase (Rosslensbroich and Stuebler, 2000).

Strains of *Trichoderma* spp. grew well in the presence of mepanipyrim, conidia germination and production were respectively moderately and completely reduced. Thus, this strain showed good compatibility with the mepanipyrim. This fungicide showed excellent activity on *Botrytis cinerea* and no significant phytotoxicity (Nagata *et al.*, 2004). It controls *Venturia* spp. on grapes, vegetables, apples and pears, and *Monilinia fructicola* on Fisheries (Maeno *et al.*, 1990). The mepanipyrim is 2-anilino-4-methyl-6-(1-propynyl) pyrimidine affect the intracellular transport of secreted proteins process (Miura *et al.*, 1994) This fungicide tended to affect both mycelial growth and pectinase secretion of younger *B. cinerea* mycelia more strongly than older cultures, which is suggestive of its mode of action. Mepanipyrim was more effective in inhibiting pectinase secretion and in disease

control activity against *B. cinerea* in the early stages of growth and infection (Miura and Maeno, 2007).

*Trichoderma* strains tested showed significant compatibility in the presence of Fenhexamid. Caron *et al.* (1994) have established the compatibility chart of *Trichoderma* MAUL-20 with the most commonly used pesticides in greenhouses. They showed that the Fenhexamid is among the active ingredients compatible with *Trichoderma* MAUL-20. Fenhexamid, hydroxylanilide, is an inhibitor of sterol biosynthesis. When the fungus *Botrytis cinerea* was grown in the presence of fenhexamid, the ergosterol content was reduced, and three 3-keto compounds, 4-methylfecosterone, fecosterone and episterone, accumulated, suggesting an inhibition of the 3-keto reductase involved in C-4 demethylation (Debieu *et al.*, 2001). Bagwan (2010) showed that the Thiram (0.2%) was compatible with *Trichoderma harzianum* and *T. viride*. However, strains of *Trichoderma* spp. tested could not grow in the presence of Thiram. The results are confirmed by the work of Mclean *et al.* (2001), which showed by the test spore germination *in vitro* that *T. harzianum* is very sensitive to this fungicide. Roberti *et al.* (2006) also assess the *in vitro* sensitivity of *T. atroviride*, *T. harzianum*, *T. reesei* and *T. viride* to thiram. The active ingredient thiram belongs to the family of dithiocarbamates that are effective on many pathogenic fungi including *B. cinerea* (Hmouni *et al.*, 2003). dithiocarbamates inhibit a variety of enzymes, such as those of glycolysis (Ragsdale et Sisler, 1991).

As for chlorothalonil, *Trichoderma* strains (TH1 and TV1) have appeared very sensitive and the two others (Tcomp and TH3) have proved moderate resistance to this active ingredient. Bagwan (2010) showed that *Trichoderma* was very sensitive to chlorothalonil, other researchers found that some wild strains of *Trichoderma* are tolerant to high concentrations of chlorothalonil during germination (Abd-El Moity *et al.*, 1982).

The results obtained made it possible to demonstrate the compatibility of the *Trichoderma* strains with the tested fungicides. Thus, Tcomp *Trichoderma harzianum* strain showed high compatibility both for the mycelial growth and for the germination of the conidia in the presence of most active ingredients. These data can be used as part of an integrated strategy against *Botrytis cinerea* by *T. harzianum* with compatible fungicides.

## Acknowledgments

This study was conducted under the national program to support sector research, project RS-23: "Phytosanitary status of strawberry farming in Morocco and looking for alternative control means: Production and formulation of a *Trichoderma* spp. Biofungicide" funded by National Centre for Scientific and Technical Research (CNRST), Rabat, Morocco.

## References

- Abd-EL Moiy T.H., Papavizas G.C. and Shtla M.N., 1982. Induction of new isolates of *Trichoderma harzianum* tolerant to fungicides and their experimental use for control of white rot of onion. *Phytopathology*, 72: 396-400.

- Archbold D. D., Hamilton-Kemp T. R., Barth M. M., and Langlois B. E., 1997. Identifying natural volatile compounds that control gray mold (*Botrytis cinerea*) during postharvest storage of strawberry, blackberry, and grape. *J. Agric. Food Chem.* 45:4032-4037.
- Bagwan N.B., 2010. Evaluation of *Trichoderma* compatibility with fungicides, pesticides, organic cakes and botanicals for integrated management of soil borne diseases of soybean (*Glycine max* (L) Merrill). *Int. J. Plant Prot.*, 3: 206-209.
- Bahous M., Ouazzani touhami A., Badoc A., Douira A., 2005. Effet de l'azoxystrobine sur la pyriculariose, l'helminthosporiose et la curvulariose du riz. *Bull. Soc. Pharm. Bordeaux*, 144: 27-46.
- Bankole S.A. and Adebajo A., 1996. Biocontrol of brown blotch of cowpea caused by *Colletotrichum truncatum* with *Trichoderma viride*. *Crop Protection*, 15 (7): 633-636.
- Bartlett D. W., Clough J. M., Godwin J. R., Hall A. A., Hamer M. & Parr-Dobrzanski B., 2002. The strobilurin fungicides. *Pest Management Science*, 58: 649-662.
- Becker W. F., von Jagow G., Anke T., Steglich W., 1981. Oudemansin, strobilurin A, Strobilurin B and myxothiazol: new inhibitors of the bc1 segment of the respiratory chain with an E- methoxyacrylate system as common structured element. *FEBS Lett.*, 132 (2): 329-333.
- Bendahmane B.S., Mahiout D., Benzohra I.E. and Benkada M.Y., 2012. Antagonism of Three *Trichoderma* species against *Botrytis fabae* and *B. cinerea*, the Causal Agents of Chocolate Spot of Faba Bean (*Vicia faba* L.) In Algeria. *World Applied Sci. J.*, 17: 278-283.
- Berber F., Ouazzani Touhami A., Badoc A., Douira A., 2009. Antagonisme *in vitro* et *in vivo* de deux *Trichoderma* à l'égard de quatre espèces de *Bipolaris* pathogènes sur le sorgho. *Bull. Soc. Pharm. Bordeaux*, 148: 93-114.
- Card S. D., 2005. Biological control of *Botrytis cinerea* in lettuce and strawberry crops. PhD Thesis, Lincoln University, Canterbury, New Zealand. 170 pp.
- Caron J., Thibodeau P.O. et Bélanger R.R., 1994. Sélection d'isolats de *Trichoderma* comme agent de lutte biologique contre la moisissure grise (*Botrytis cinerea*) dans la production de la tomate de serre. Rapport de recherche, Club d'encadrement technique Pro-Serre. 48 pp.
- Chet, I. 1987. *Trichoderma* - application, mode of action, and potential as a biocontrol agent of soilborne plant pathogenic fungi. In: I. Chet (ed.), *Innovative Approaches to Plant Disease Control*, pp. 137-160. John Wiley & Sons: New York.
- Debieu D., Bach J., Hugon M., Malosse C. and Leroux P., 2001. The hydroxyanilide fenhexamid, a new sterol biosynthesis inhibitor fungicide efficient against the plant pathogenic fungus *Botryotinia fuckeliana* (*Botrytis cinerea*). *Pest Management Science*, (57) 11: 1060-1067.
- Divya R.V., Narayan R.P, Uma D.G., Sokka R.S., 2011. Evaluation of biocontrol agents against *Rhizoctonia solani* f.sp *sasakii* causing banded leaf and sheath blight of maize. *Indian Journal of Plant Protection*, 39 (3): 208- 211.
- Errampalli D. and Naomi Crnko N., 2004. Control of blue mold caused by *Penicillium expansum* on apples 'Empire' with fludioxonil and cyprodinil. *Can. J. Plant Pathol.*, 26: 70-75.
- Fangsheng N., Zhigiang M. and Qiuyan B., 2013. The synergism of *Trichoderma harzianum* interaction with Boscalid to *Botrytis cinerea*. *Chinese Agricultural Science Bulletin*, 12: 201-205.
- Forster B., Staub T., 1996. Basis for use strategies of anilinopyrimidine and phenylpyrrole fungicides against *Botrytis cinerea* *Crop Protection*, 15 (6): 529-537.
- Freeman S., Minz D., Kolesnik I, Barbul O., Zveibil A., Maymon M., Nitzani Y., Kirshner B., Rav-David D., Bilu A., Dag A., Shafir S. and Elad Y., 2004. *Trichoderma* biocontrol of *Colletotrichum acutatum* and *Botrytis cinerea* and survival in strawberry. *European Journal of Plant Pathology*, 110: 361-370.
- Gabriolotto C., Monchiero M., Nègre M., Spadaro D. and Gullino M. L., 2009. Effectiveness of control strategies against *Botrytis cinerea* in vineyard and evaluation of the residual fungicide concentrations. *Journal of Environmental Science and Health Part B*, 44: 389-396.
- Gehmann K. B., Nyfeler R., Leaedbeater A. J., Nevil D., Sozzi D., 1990. CGA 173506: a new phenylpyrrole fungicide for broad spectrum disease control. *Proceedings of the Brighton Crop Protection Conference Pests and Disease*: 399-406.
- Ha T. N., 2010. Using *Trichoderma* species for biological control of plant pathogens in Viet Nam. *J. ISSAAS*, 16 (1):17-21.
- Heye U., Speich J., Siegle H., Steinemann A., Forster B., Knauf-Beiter G., Herzog J., Hubele, A., 1994. CGA 219417: a novel broad spectrum fungicide. *Crop Prot.*, 13: 541-549.
- Hilber U. W., Hilber-Bodmer M., 1998. Genetic basic and monitoring of resistance of *Botryotinia fuckeliana* to anilinopyrimidines. *Plant Dis.*, 82: 496-500.
- Hmouni A., Mouria A. et Douira A. 2006. Biological control of tomato grey mould with compost water extracts, *Trichoderma* sp. and *Gliocladium* sp. *Phytopathol. Mediterr.*, 45: 110-116.
- Hmouni A., Oihabi L., Badoc A., Douira A., 2003. Étude de la résistance de *Botrytis cinerea* aux benzimidazoles, dicarboximides et dithiocarbamates dans les cultures abritées de tomates de la région du Gharb (Maroc). *Bull. Soc. Pharm. Bordeaux*, 142 (1-4): 79-100.
- Hongman C., Jie C., Guoshi G. and Hemin L., 2005. Mutation of *Trichoderma* in tolerance to pyrimethanil and induction of related protein. *Acta phytophylacica Sinica*, 32(1):77-80.
- Kredics L., Antal Z., Manczinger L., Szekeres A. Kevei F. and Nagy E., 2003. Influence of environmental parameters on *Trichoderma* strains with biocontrol Potential. *Food Technol. Biotechnol.*, 41 (1): 37-42.
- Lee S. K., Sohn H. B., Kim G. G. and Chung Y. R., 2006. Enhancement of biological control of *Botrytis cinerea* on cucumber by foliar sprays and bed potting mixes of *Trichoderma harzianum* YC459 and Its application of tomato in the greenhouse. *Plant Pathol. J.*, 22 (3): 283-288.
- Leroux P., 2003. Mode of action of agrochemicals towards plant pathogens. *Comptes Rendus de Biologie*, 326: 9-21.

- Leroux, P. 1996. Recent developments in the mode of action of fungicides. *Pestic. Sci.*, 47: 191-197.
- Lisboa B.B., Bochese C.C., Vargas L.K., Silveira J.R.P., Radin B., Oliveira A.M.R., 2007. Eficiência de *Trichoderma harzianum* e *Gliocladium viride* na redução da incidência de *Botrytis cinerea* em tomateiro cultivado sob ambiente protegido. *Ciência Rural*, 37: 1255-1260.
- Locke J.C., Marois J.J. and Papavizas G.C., 1985. Biological control of *Fusarium* wilt of greenhouse-grown chrysanthemums. *Plant Dis.*, 69: 167-169.
- Maeno S., Miura I., Masuda K. and Nagata T., 1990. Mepanipyrim (KIF-3535), a new pyrimidine fungicide. Brighton Crop Protection Conference, Pests and Diseases, 2: 415-422.
- Masner P., Muster P., Schmid J., 1994. Possible methionine biosynthesis inhibition by pyrimidinamine fungicides. *Pestic. Sci.*, 42: 163-166.
- Mclean K.L., Hunt J. and Stewart A., 2001. Compatibility of the biocontrol agent *Trichoderma harzianum* C52 with selected fungicides. *New Zealand Plant Protection*, 54: 84-88.
- Milling R. J. and Richardson C. J., 1995. Mode of action of the anilino-pyrimidine fungicide pyrimethanil. 2. Effects on enzyme secretion in *Botrytis cinerea*. *Pest Management Science*, 45 (1):43-48.
- Miura I., Kamakura T., Maeno S., Hayashi S. and Yamaguchi I., 1994. Inhibition of enzyme secretion in plant pathogens by mepanipyrim, a novel fungicide. *Pesticide Biochemistry & Physiology*, 48(3): 222-228.
- Miura I., Maeno S., 2007. Effect of culture age on mepanipyrim-mediated inhibition of pectinase secretion in *Botrytis cinerea*. *Journal of Pesticide Science* Vol. 32(2): 106-111.
- Monte E., 2001. "Understanding *Trichoderma*: Between biotechnology and microbial ecology," *Int. Microbiol.*, 4: 1-4.
- Mouria A., Ouazzani Touhami A. et Douira A. 2003. Etude de certains facteurs favorisant le maintien de l'activité antagoniste de *Trichoderma harzianum* à l'égard de *Helminthosporium oryzae* sur les feuilles de riz. *Cah Rech. Univ. Hassan II Casablanca, sér. A (Sciences et Techniques)*, 5: 50-66.
- Nagata T., Masuda K., Maeno S., 2004. Synthesis and structure-activity study of fungicidal anilino-pyrimidines leading to mepanipyrim (KIF-3535) as an anti-*Botrytis* agent. *Pest Manag Sci.*, 60(4): 399-407.
- Nelson M. E. and Powelson M. L. 1988. Biological control of grey mold of snap beans by *Trichoderma hamatum*. *Plant Dis.*, 72 (8): 727-729.
- Nyfelner R., Ackermann P., 1992. Phenylpyrroles, a new class of agricultural fungicides related to the natural antibiotic pyrrolnitrin. In *Synthesis and Chemistry of Agrochemicals*; Baker, D. R., Fenyves, J. G., Steffens, J. J., Eds.; American Chemical Society: Washington, DC, pp 395-440.
- ONSSA, 2015. Homologation des intrants chimiques. Office National de Sécurité Sanitaire des Produits Alimentaires (ONSSA)- services en ligne. URL, <http://eservice.onssa.gov.ma/Default.aspx> (Consulted 21/09/2015)
- Papavizas G. C., 1985. *Trichoderma* and *Gliocladium*: Biology, Ecology, and Potential for Biocontrol. *Annual Review of Phytopathology*, 23: 23-54.
- Pillonel C. and Meyer T., 1997. Effect of phenylpyrroles on glycerol accumulation and protein kinase activity on *Neurospora cras*. *Pestic. Sci.*, 49: 229-236.
- Ragsdale N.N. and Sisler H.D., 1991. The nature, modes of action and toxicity of fungicides. In Pimentel D. (Ed.), *Handbook of pest management in agriculture*, vol 2. Boca Raton. FL.: CRC Press, p. 461-496.
- Ramanujam B., Prasad R. D., Sriram S. and Rangeswaran R., 2010. Mass production, formulation, quality control and delivery of *Trichoderma* for plant disease management. *The Journal of Plant Protection Sciences*, 2(2): 1-8.
- Roberti R., Badiali F., Pisi A., Veronesi A., Pancaldi D. and Cesari A., 2006. Sensitivity of *Clonostachys rosea* and *Trichoderma* spp. as Potential Biocontrol Agents to Pesticides. *J. Phytopath.*, 154: 100-109.
- Rosslensbroich H.J and Stuebler D., 2000. *Botrytis cinerea* — history of chemical control and novel fungicides for its management. *Crop Protection*, 19 (8-10): 557-561.
- Samuels, G.J., 1996. *Trichoderma*: a review of biology and systematics of the genus. *Mycol. Res.* 100:923-935.
- Shovan L. R., 2012. Characterization of *Botrytis cinerea*, *Trichoderma* species and other fungi, including studies on inhibitory effects of chitosan and fungicides. Master thesis. Publisher: Norwegian Journal of Agricultural Sciences, Ås Permanentlink: [http://www.nb.no/idtjeneste/URN:NBN:no-bibsys\\_brage\\_29945](http://www.nb.no/idtjeneste/URN:NBN:no-bibsys_brage_29945), <http://hdl.handle.net/11250/186353>
- Sreenivasaprasad S. and Manibhushanrao K., 1990. Biocontrol potential of fungal antagonists *Gliocladium virens* and *Trichoderma longibrachiatum*. *J. Plant Dis. Prot.*, 97: 570-571.
- Vincent J.M., 1947. Distortion of fungal hyphae in the presence of certain inhibitors. *Nature*, 159: 850-850.
- Von Jagow G., and Link T.A., 1986. Use of specific inhibitors on the mitochondrial bc1 complex. *MethodsEnzymol.*, 126: 253-271.
- Yuan S., Zuo G. and Chen H., 2007. Studies on the Induction of Biocontrol Drug-resistant Factor from *Trichoderma* and its Biochemical Characteristics. *Journal of Anhui Agricultural Science*, 24: 7523-7524.
- Zaldúa S. and Sanfuentes E., 2010. Control de *Botrytis cinerea* en miniestacas de *Eucalyptus globulus* Utilizando Cepas de *Clonostachys* y *Trichoderma*. *Chilean J. Agric. Res.* [online], 70 (4): 576-582.
- Zheng D., Olaya G. and Koller W., 2000. Characterization of laboratory mutants of *Venturia inaequalis* resistant to strobilurin-related fungicide kresoxim-methyl. – *Current Genet.*, 38 (3): 148-155.

\*\*\*\*\*

#### How to cite this article:

Wafa Khir Allah *et al.* 2016, Compatibility of *Trichoderma* SPP. With some fungicides under *in vitro* conditions. *Int J Recent Sci Res.* 7(2), pp. 9060-9067.